

38016

VOL. 1

HAITI: NGO SECTOR STUDY

Alice L. Morton

March 19, 1997

ABBREVIATIONS

CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CARE	Care International
CBO	Community-Based Organization
CG	Consultative Group
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
DGI	Tax General Directorate
EERP	Emergency Economic Recovery Program
EU	European Union
FAES	Economic and Social Fund
FY	Fiscal Year
GOH	Government of Haiti
HAVA	Haitian Association of Voluntary Agencies
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
IDA	International Development Association
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MCH	Maternal-Child Health
MDOD	Maître d'oeuvre Déliqué
MPCE	Ministry of Plan and External Cooperation
MSPP	Ministry of Public Health and Population
NEAP	National Environmental Action Plan
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PFP	Policy Framework Paper
PSM	Public Sector Modernization
PVO	Private Voluntary Organization
TA	Technical Assistance
UCS	Unite Communale de Sante/Communal Health Unit
UCG/CIU	Unite Centrale de Gestion /Central Implementation Unit
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	U.S. Agency for International Development

Currency Equivalents

(as of August 13, 1996)

Currency Unit	Haitian Gourde
US\$1.00	HTG15.1

Fiscal Year

October 1 to September 30

PREFACE

As the initial effort under the World Bank/GOH Haiti Poverty Assessment, this study of the NGO sector was carried out from January 1996 through January 1997. The study was coordinated by Ms. Alice L. Morton (Consultant), under the initial Task Management of Ms. Ana-Maria Arriagada, in LA2CO. After a reorganization of the LAC Region in the World Bank, Ms. Judy Baker, LA3C2, became the Task Manager. Individual sector working papers were prepared by a number of national and international consultants. Shelagh O'Rourke prepared the working paper on health and population; Florence Jean-Louis that on education; Lisa Taber the overview of water supply and solid waste management; Wendeline De Zan prepared the working paper on women-specific NGO interventions and human rights NGOs; J. Ronald Toussaint did the working paper on NGO involvement in Natural Resources Management and Environmental Protection. Alistair Rodd, Franck Lanoix, and a number of Haitian interviewers designed and carried out the fieldwork for the survey of 100 CBOs, and were assisted in the analysis by ILSI, a Haitian consulting firm. Ms. Morton prepared an interim report on large international and national NGOs, and wrote this final synthesis report.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

BACKGROUND TO THE NGO SECTOR STUDY

1. For most of the 1987-1994 period, major donors had turned to the already-vibrant NGO community to provide basic services and safety net programs, given the inability of a series of haitian regimes to do so. An estimated \$100 million of official development assistance was administered by NGOs from 1992-1994, following the coup d'Etat against President Aristide. In 1996, there was a peaceful democratic transition to the government of President Preval. Following agreements with international agencies, this government is attempting an ambitious program of economic and public sector reforms. In the context of these reforms, the future role of the NGO sector in Haiti's development has been a subject of considerable debate.

2. By early 1997, it was generally agreed that in certain sectors such as health and education, water supply and sanitation, as well as small-scale infrastructure construction and rehabilitation, NGOs will continue to play a major role in service design and delivery, especially in remote rural areas and among the urban poor, where the GOH has scarcely any autonomous delivery capacity. But as donor flows decrease, which is likely by the year 2000, who will fund service provision that has been devolved from the public to the NGO and private sectors? Will the NGOs in the interim have been able to alter their fund-raising approaches, and introduce cost recovery systems that will allow them to continue to provide quality services—with GOH support—to a population that is increasing at a rate of 2.8% per year despite out-migration?

3. In order to provide the background against which to pose and answer these questions, a study of the NGO sector was designed as part of the IDA/GOH Haiti Poverty Assessment. The study included intensive qualitative interviews and site visits with a sample of 75 international and national NGOs, working throughout the country, and a quantitative survey of 100 community based organizations (CBOs). This sample represents respectively between 1/3 and 1/2 of the NGOs and about 1/10 of the CBOs currently recognized in Haiti by donors, the government and other NGOs. The study began in early 1996, involved national and international consultants, and local interviewers, and was funded by the Netherlands Trust Fund to the World Bank. Bilateral and multilateral donor staff were interviewed, as well as GOH officials and project and program beneficiaries. Workshops were held with health and population, education, women-specific and human rights NGOs to check conclusions and recommendations of background reports, and then these were revised. The draft report was reviewed by members of the IDA Haiti country team and the Resident Representative, selected NGO and donor staff in Haiti, as well as by senior GOH officials.

4. The emerging consensus is that this on-going and positively sanctioned role for international and national NGOs will, however, be increasingly conditioned by their agreement to accept norm setting and quality control by the sectoral ministries which, themselves, are to be streamlined and reinforced at the technical and managerial levels. Most ministries would also like to ensure that funds ultimately destined for NGO implemented programs first flow through them. Most donors, on the other hand, are reluctant to meet this GOH goal, for fear of decreased implementation efficiency and effectiveness.

5. An additional variable defining the literal and political space available for NGOs is the constitutionally-mandated move toward deconcentration and decentralization of powers to departmental-level representations of line ministries, and to locally elected officials and assemblies. Since most

ministries have little or no presence outside the capital, alliances with NGOs will help ensure a more rapid decentralization process, especially as communal-level elected officials and their staffs begin to take on the myriad tasks assigned to them. In the short-term, NGOs are seeking ways to sign accords with these new communal bodies, while at the same time continuing national-level strategic planning, and negotiating for project approvals at the ministerial level.

6. If this is the short-term trend, it does not necessarily predict the parameters of the medium term. Donor flows to Haiti at the moment are extremely generous—some US\$ 2 billion for 1997-99—and GOH absorptive capacity is severely limited. In the best case, even if the GOH successfully undergoes significant reforms over the next three to five years, it will still not be in a position to do much more than coordinate delivery of services *provided* by others. The agreed privatization of key para-statal organizations is likely further to limit Government's engagement in most sectors, and to provide additional scope for NGOs and the for-profit private sector.

THE PAST AND PRESENT ROLE OF NGOS IN SOCIAL SECTOR SERVICE DELIVERY

7. International and national NGOs have been providing relief, charity, and social sector services since the 1950's, but increasingly since the 1970s. The oldest NGO-run hospital, Albert Schweitzer, just celebrated its 40th birthday. In periods of crisis, when the Government of Haiti (GOH) has been unable or unwilling to provide even a minimal range of social services—including primary and curative health care, basic education, basic community water and sanitation infrastructure—NGOs have promptly stepped in, with considerable donor and private philanthropic funding. Toward the end of the second Duvalier regime, interesting partnership arrangements were made between NGOs and the Ministry of Public Health and Population, sharing staff and infrastructure under the Health for All in 2000 program. The same was true in the education sector. A number of these partnerships have survived the subsequent changes in government, the coup d'Etat, and the latest decentralization reforms.

MAJOR STUDY FINDINGS

8. It is important to distinguish between periods when major multilateral and bilateral donors were operating relief and development programs in tandem with the GOH (most of the 1960s through late 1980s), and those when they were unable or unwilling to provide funds to the GOH—the latter part of the 1980s for bilaterals such as USAID, and the 1991-1994 (De Facto) period for bilaterals and multilaterals. By 1994, NGOs were providing food distribution for approximately 800,000 Haitians per day. Observers of development assistance to Haiti stress that this was an extreme case, and thus should not be used as a baseline when comparing other years. However, available data indicate that NGOs were effective from 1987 on, as measured by clear improvements in key social indicators such as total fertility rate (down 25%), tripling of the contraceptive prevalence rate, and doubled immunization coverage. In large part, these remarkable changes can be attributed to NGO-managed interventions, especially in rural areas where NGOs were the only service providers during the post-Duvalier period. During the 1992-1994 crisis period, NGOs were the only source of basic health services in many remote areas, and are estimated as having provided at least 60% of health services in the country as a whole. Today, they probably still provide about 50% of primary and curative health services

9. While coverage by NGOs and the MSPP for health and population have increased significantly, for water supply and sanitation, the picture is less reassuring. There is very little GOH capacity in these areas, which are critical to health and to the environment. Almost all interventions that are being made are

funded through large international NGOs, who on-grant to local NGOs or other local organizations to create employment and actually implement rehabilitation or construction projects.

10. For education, the proportion of services provided by the GOH has been even lower. Traditionally, the GOH has never attempted to meet the demand for universal primary or secondary education. Most members of the urban and rural elite and middle-class were educated at private, often religious schools, and most of the rural poor remained illiterate, with the exception of those who had access to mission schooling. Although nearly 200 schools have been renovated or built in the last 18 months with the help of NGOs and direct donor funding, in early 1997, the GOH announced that its goal for the year was that there would be one nationally built, funded and staffed school in each of the 133 communes. Approximately 80% of all primary and secondary schools are either run by NGOs including confessional organizations, or are private, for-profit institutions. In agriculture, the situation is somewhat more balanced, although during the crisis period, government funds for agricultural infrastructure or other production-enhancing interventions were extremely limited. The Ministry of the Environment can afford few direct interventions, while NGOs carry out a wide variety of programs in environmental protection and natural resources management. The situation for women's oriented programs is more radical in terms of the proportions of non-government to government funding, and the Women's Affairs ministry is likely to be closed for lack of budget funds. Human rights activities are virtually the sole province of NGOs.

NGOs, POVERTY, TARGETING AND BENEFIT DELIVERY

11. A significant study finding is that most NGOs operating in Haiti are multi-sectoral or multi-purpose, and target benefits geographically, or allow beneficiaries to self-select. Others, particularly those providing food aid, or health services use a variety of targeting systems designed to identify those most in need. A growing number of national NGOs target women specifically, although their programs sometime include men. Most NGOs have no clear definition of poverty, or poverty indicators, although their mission statements usually stress assisting the poor and the most vulnerable. The underlying assumption of NGO operations is that most Haitians are poor, and that almost all residents of certain areas of the country are among the poorest and the most vulnerable. This may be a largely accurate assumption. There is considerable leakage in food aid programs, but in other kinds of programs, benefit capture by elites may be less prominent than it was in the past. Yet, this lack of indicators means that it is difficult to assess performance in impact rather than in output terms. Most NGOs, including local-level organizations, are hierarchical in structure, even where they include beneficiaries in decision-making or in "self-help" implementation. All those above the CBO level are run by professional staff, and these staff are often highly qualified technicians. Mid-level managers are in shorter supply, and there is keen competition for them. NGOs have consistently offered an attractive alternative to the civil service for at least 15 years since they provide better salaries, better working conditions, political insulation. These factors appear to outweigh the fact that for Haitians at least, they have only recently begun to offer real career opportunities.

12. Another significant study finding is that the types of NGOs, and relative numbers of each type, are shifting. The study samples allow the following typology:

Type I - Base-level Organizations. Estimates for total numbers of such organizations vary between 2,000 and 12,000 for the country as a whole, depending on whether formal registration of some kind is a criterion for inclusion, and/or whether the organization must currently be engaging in some recognized activity. Many of these organizations are *gwoupman paysan* (peasant associations) or *gwoupman katye* (urban neighborhood groups) that have arisen with the anti-Duvalier movement and the *Ti l'Eglise* that became the Lavalas. Ruthlessly pursued and harassed during the De Facto period, many of

these organizations are now beginning to thrive, and carry out both developmental and political activities in urban neighborhoods and in rural areas. Some are networked through federations or more informal regional and national associations, and through political "cartels" or parties. They are both the providers of self-help and GOH-or party-funded activities to improve their communities' economic situation, including that of the most vulnerable or poorest members, and recipients of grants from intermediate NGOS or directly from donors, or from GOH-run safety-net agencies such as FAES and the UCG. The same is true for non-political community-based organizations that emerge from church groups, or around the desire to improve the community, build a school, or respond to calls from donors or intermediate NGOs or the GOH to start a local health committee, repair a road, create a community council, and make an application for project funding of some sort. These kinds of organizations, although often run in a very top-down manner, are still more likely to represent their beneficiaries, and to empower at least some of them, than are exogenous organizations at a higher administrative level.

Type II - Intermediate NGOs. It is probably that there are closer to 400 than 200 organizations in this category, if all confessional organizations are counted. There are four sub-types of intermediate NGOs: 1) those that a) originated in Haiti, though they may have non-Haitian members; b) have a board of directors and officers and are registered with the Ministry of Plan and External Cooperation (MPCE); c) receive external funding of some kind, though they may also have a strong voluntary base, and d) serve as brokers or partners in the space between CBOs and the larger national and international NGOs that are more closely tied to donor projects and contracts. These are sometimes called "tutor" NGOs, since they often do training, grant-seeking and "animation". Type 2 are run and staffed by expatriates but with an increasing shift toward Haitian staffing, and decentralization from the parent NGO in Europe or the US to the Haitian "representation". These will be referred to as "transitional" NGOs. Type 3 are value-based advocacy and research NGOs that try to institute changes in the development agenda in Haiti and among donors, or seek alternative development models. They specialize in training and communicating their ideas through seminars and courses, as well as mass-media presentations. Type 4 may be Haitian or expatriate in origin, but act primarily as brokers or clearing-houses. Churches have twinning activities between North American and European congregations and Haitian ones. Some locally based organizations are also seeking twinning relationships with cities in Europe and the U.S. to help sponsor particular projects. Type 4 organizations, have fewer professional, full-time staff than do the other three types, and their emphasis on a spirit of volunteerism is much greater.

Intermediate NGOs are increasing in numbers as formerly expatriate NGOs that have worked in Haiti for many years begin to set up subsidiaries which are Haitian directed and Haitian staffed (ADRA, PROTOS/Haiti, WorldVision/Haiti, GRET/Haiti). They are also increasing as educated Haitians, among the Diaspora, in Port-au-Prince and in rural areas see that there is money available through the NGO channel for projects of all types. Many of these individuals are well-meaning and actively seek the betterment or development of their areas of origin. Those who have been trained by a parent NGO often do extremely competent technical work, which is often very well managed, sometimes despite donor-introduced constraints. Those that are just starting out may have more difficulty finding competent technical and managerial staff. In Haiti, as elsewhere, the NGO sector provides a subsidy to middle and higher level civil servants whose salaries are generally very low. There are allegations that many educated people set up "phony" NGOs so as to benefit from import duty and tax exonerations. This is not a new allegation, and it may well be true that a number of these newer intermediate "tutor" NGOs are merely parasitic, and that they never deliver either grants or services to the local populations who are their ostensible clients.

Type III - Large PVOs/NGOs. The larger national and international NGOs, of which there are about 20 operating in Haiti at present, have become almost a separate "industry" bidding on large-scale donor funded projects in food aid, labor intensive public works, environmental protection, infrastructure

construction and rehabilitation, health, justice and agricultural services. Some of these groups still maintain their earlier programs of assistance to sponsored children, small and medium credit, rural development based in a particular locality, MCH, literacy training and the like. Increasingly, their areas of program emphasis follow funding availability, and they are more frequently competing with for-profit companies and overseas para-statal for donor contracts, as their national "entitlements" diminish. Managers of most of these NGOs indicate that they are increasingly decentralizing planning and funds management to the "field" in Haiti, and that they are seeking closer relationships with intermediate Haitian NGOs and CBOs, in order to increase participation as they move into development activities and away from relief.

Type IV - Foundations. There are three types of foundations operating in the development sphere in Haiti: 1) older NGO foundations that are funded by European NGOs, and that on-grant to local organizations, either locality-based or sectorally-based, to carry out small-scale, partly self-help projects. Most of these started in community or rural development. Some are moving into credit; 2) new private foundations being set up by some of the "leading" merchant families of Haiti. So far, few of these are providing social services directly or by funding NGOs; 3) foundations being set up by the growing commercial banking sector. Some of these give grants for a variety of purposes, while some choose to emphasize one type of intervention—small and medium enterprise credit, for example,

Type V - Umbrella Associations. As the non-governmental sector has matured in Haiti, several umbrella NGOs have emerged, most with an initial injection of USAID funding. HAVA is the largest and most inclusive umbrella organization for NGOs, and is currently seeking to recover its place as a provider of reliable research and information on NGO and other development activities. For health sector NGOs, there is AOPS, the *Association des Oeuvres Privées de la Santé* that provides coordination and technical assistance. For education, FONHEP seeks to maintain quality standards, to train teachers, revise curricula, and provide other services to the thousands of NGO-funded and private sector schools which it represents. In environment and agriculture, there are several professional associations seeking to set policy together with the GOH, as is true in health and education, water and sanitation, human rights, and women—oriented activities, as well as human rights and justice-related interventions. The extent to which these umbrella organizations serve effectively as lobbies for their members, and provide an ethical framework for their activities, differs by sector, but in general, they are increasingly interested in self-monitoring and in working in partnership with other organizations and the GOH.

CHANGING MISSIONS AND CHANGING PARTNERS

13. Given this wealth of types and levels of NGOs operating in Haiti, it is not surprising that there is considerable overlap, among their activities, and an increasing amount of competition. Whereas in earlier days, various regions of the country were "assigned" to key bilateral donors, and NGOs they funded worked primarily in those regions, today as needs spread and as donors and projects have multiplied, these geographic divisions are less absolute. If the US and Canada were initially the most important sources of official and philanthropic support for NGOs in Haiti, there have always been European agencies, both confessional and secular, supporting social services and doing good in Haiti as well. While it is still true that most NGOs receive a majority of funding from their "home" agencies and citizens, today there is considerably more diversification in sources of funding, as well as in activities funded. CARE, for example, receives funding from three different countries, several additional agencies, and in turn acts as a donor to several Haitian NGOs. The transitional NGOs are beginning to reach out for more diverse funding as they become "weaned" from the metropolitan parent organizations. Smaller and base-level organizations are currently poised to receive funds from several intermediary NGOs at the same time, as well as from larger international and national ones.

14. What is most interesting about the NGO sector in Haiti today is that it is beginning to change. For those NGOs that traditionally received significant and constant funding from the U.S. Agency for International Development, particularly those working in health and population, funding is diminishing, and belts are being tightened. More efforts at fund raising, cost-recovery and other means to continue service provision are being undertaken, although there is likely to be a slump in delivery even if these shifts are successfully made. The high 1994 funding and delivery levels for the NGO sector are unlikely to be attained again. The larger international NGOs are increasingly moving from relief to development, both at the behest of their key donor agencies, and in line with changing times. Still, in Haiti, there are likely always to be natural disasters, if not always political ones; NGOs will continue to distribute food aid, although at lower levels and through more focused programs. In education, water and sanitation, environmental protection, human rights, women-oriented development, as well as in agriculture and other modes of production, it is likely that NGOs will continue to play an important role, although once again, sources and levels of funding are not likely to increase overall, even though the multilateral donor agencies are beginning to work through NGOs as the bilaterals are shifting some funds away from them.

15. Even those GOH ministers who have agreed to continue to work with and through NGOs, such as the Ministers of Agriculture, Health and Education, emphasize their prerogatives—setting sector policies, establishing norms, inspecting service delivery points, and evaluating performance. Under public sector reform programs already agreed, they should be able to develop the capacity to carry out these functions effectively. However, to do so, they will need more cooperation from the NGO community than they have had in the past, as well as from the donors themselves. Aid management is a significant burden to a government over 90% of whose investment budget is externally financed. Donors compete to dominate sectors and regions, and so do their NGO intermediaries. In the short term, there is enough money for all, but by the end of the 1990s, the kind of overlap and duplication that is generally true of donor-funded programs in Haiti—and thus of NGO programs—will no longer be affordable. It is then that we may expect to see a real shift in numbers and levels of NGOs remaining in operation. Until then, however, there is time for a considerable amount of capacity building and partnering to take place, and for the major actors themselves to strengthen the enabling environment for future collaboration. At present, there is a critical mass of competent national and international NGOs operating in Haiti through which the GOH and its international donor partners can get benefits to Haiti's urban and rural poor.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ALL PARTIES

- **Enhance Institutional Capacity.** Findings from all sector working papers and multisectoral organization interviews indicate that there is a wide range of institutional capacity represented in the NGO sector in Haiti. But most of the evidence seems to show that there is a critical mass of large, medium-sized and small organizations with better than average track records that can absorb more funds, and use them more efficiently and effectively if they receive a little more technical assistance and training. This should not, however, be of a general type, but rather specific to the sector and to the socioeconomic issues these organizations are dealing with. To the extent possible, generic training materials by sector and socio-economic issue can be developed on the basis of best-practice examples, and then customized for particular courses, or coaching sessions.

- **Improve Analysis for Management Effectiveness.** Coordination, personnel management, stakeholder analysis, gender analysis, cost-effectiveness assessment, fund-raising, and beneficiary assessment are all areas where many if not most NGOs studied can be strengthened. These are not merely buzz-words or current development fads, but rather the practices that yield better results in

terms of additional and higher quality benefit provision., as is shown by the best practice examples given in this report.

- **Enhance Technical Capacity.** Technology transfer is complex in Haiti, but as has been noted for health care, for example, the quality of some services is truly excellent, and those Haitian specialists and generalists—including public health practitioners at all levels—who have received quality training are able to do a good job, and to train others. Domestically-available TA, as through AOPS, or FONHEP is often sufficient, although the amount available is limited by funding rather than by the quality available on the local market. Particularly weak or new sectors, such as some in the areas of environmental and natural resources management, may require some external technical assistance inputs, where there are readily adaptable lessons learned from other-country environments. Present efforts by donors to attract Diaspora Haitians back to work in development-related fields, both inside and outside government, may be fruitful, although salary levels are frequently an issue.

- **Disseminate Information about On-going Activities.** Given the publicity received by recent events in Haiti, there is a wealth of new initiatives which are often well intentioned but based on too little knowledge of Haitian realities. This is an area where some classic NGO/PVO methods are being adapted to meet the new situation. An example is the recently created Florida International Volunteer program, which is bringing Diaspora Haitians and other technical specialists for brief periods to do particular, targeted interventions in Haiti. This is an approach which has been used successfully in the past by Project HOPE, and by other international institutions, such as the Lyons Clubs, Rotary, and other membership associations. Peace Corps volunteers are once again in Haiti, working on organizational development and agro-processing projects. Getting it right is particularly important in these kinds of “quick-fix”, targeted interventions, whether they involve service provision or short-term training. Here, the general lack of a readily accessible inventory of NGO activities already in place reduces the effectiveness of new initiatives.

- **Allow the Beneficiaries to Choose.** One of the characteristics of voluntary agencies is that they try to choose activities that fit their missions, and that will satisfy their benefactors. This means that if a particular organization wants to work in AIDS prevention, it is unlikely to be easily persuaded to work in environmental protection instead, for example. Also, in Haiti as elsewhere, many NGO programs are donor-driven. One possible mitigating factor may be creation of communal-level social service plans, to be monitored by social service committees. It is at least plausible that in the medium term, as decentralized entities become stronger, they will be able to encourage more discrimination in the communities’ acceptance of “free” goods and services. The central government counterpart to this would be a better information base available in Port-au-Prince and at Haitian consulates and embassies abroad about what is already being done, and broad distribution of an updated HAVA directory to these posts. Since the draft law on NGOs includes the possibility of registration at these diplomatic representations rather than at the MPCE, this idea may have some merit.

- **Enhance the Enabling Environment.** The sustainability of NGO programs after the donor has withdrawn, and once public/private partnership have been defined, merits further exploration by the donor-NGO-GOH community as a whole, together with anticipated and existing beneficiaries. Taking this approach to the partnership question should also focus attention on the GOH’s comparative advantage in getting out of the service delivery business—an idea which is already under discussion in a number of sectors. One forum for this discussion, with a poverty-alleviation emphasis, is the proposed national dialogue and strategy/action planning process that is intrinsic to the Poverty Assessment. Other fora are also available, and should be exploited as much as possible, including meetings of the Prime Minister’s Commission on Poverty Alleviation, non-NGO association meetings, television and radio talk shows, and

church group meetings. The important thing is to define the terms of the dialogue in a constructive way, and then to keep the ball in play.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE WORLD BANK/IDA AND OTHER DONOR AGENCIES

- **Reduce Duplication and Overlap.** IDA and other international donor agencies, both bilateral and multilateral, are already critically involved in funding humanitarian assistance and development interventions that include international and national NGOs. Despite considerable and persisting efforts to coordinate within and among sectors in providing aid to Haiti, there is still a great deal of overlap at the same time that there are critical gaps. One suggestion for mitigating this situation is to have NGOs as participants or observers at the next Consultative Group meeting, and at any subsequent IDA-sponsored Implementation Reviews. The World Bank is already a co-sponsor of a regional Latin American and Caribbean NGO conference each year, but it should be noted that in 1996, the Haitian umbrella organizations invited were unable to provide funding or representatives to attend.

- **Support Monitoring Systems that Track Results.** In addition to this kind of periodic joint review, IDA is interested in supporting the GOH in improving its ability to monitor the performance of all donor-funded projects, including those implemented by NGOs. This would be done in collaboration with the UNDP, which is already implementing a project to inventory donor assistance to Haiti with the MPCE. The current thinking is that such a performance tracking system would be decentralized, so that more beneficiary and elected assembly input could be obtained, and such feedback used to assist implementors to make mid-course corrections where necessary. This is not the same thing as the old UCAONG “control and regulation” model, but would more resemble the kind of monitoring that has been characteristic of the PL 480 management office over the years. Initial design and piloting could be supported by an International Development Fund Grant.

- **Determine Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Efficiency Measures.** More in-depth analysis should be carried out of the relative cost-effectiveness of NGO, for-profit and public sector delivery systems by sector and sub-sector. In some instances, this analysis may already exist in the annexes of discrete project documents, but overall, there is no body of information readily available to all the actors on the basis of which standards could be set, and comparisons of performance made. Such analysis should include social costs and benefits as well as economic ones, and might be based on the coproduction model—all of the social services and goods discussed in this report are “co-produced”; that is, they require the active participation of the beneficiaries themselves in order to be achieved.

- **Update NGO Funding Policies and Mechanisms.** As the political and economic situation in Haiti continues to become more stable, donors should continue to update their policies on funding of NGOs, private-sector firms and direct funding to the GOH, focusing on comparative advantage, and cost-effectiveness. Where necessary, they should also offer training to all of these categories of implementing partners in accounting for funds, disbursement, and performance monitoring, as IDA has begun to do in the past year. While it is unrealistic to anticipate that even the major donor agencies will come up with a mutually-agreed “short-form” for reporting, they could give more attention to making reporting requirements clear. Another shared practice that would not require major resource commitments would be broad circulation of terms and conditions of grants and loans available through donor-funded intermediaries.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE GOVERNMENT OF HAITI

- **Develop Reasoned Policy toward NGO Implementors and Service Providers.** If the GOH—both at the center and at the periphery—continues a good-faith effort to implement its current policies in the areas of justice, rule of law, deconcentration and decentralization, as well as streamlining the public sector and “reinventing” the State, the mandates and activities of the NGO sector will of necessity be affected. However, these effects are likely to be salutary, and in the interests both of the NGOs themselves and of their existing and intended beneficiaries. Modalities may change, however, especially for those large, international NGOs that have in the past been able to enjoy a great deal of independence, but are now finding a new role as implementing arms of the GOH through the *MDOD* model.

- **Implement New Tax and Customs Exhonorations Policies Fairly.** In the past, according to both NGO and GOH representatives, the key issue of exhonorations and taxation has brought some of the larger NGOs to threaten to quit Haiti. More recently, however, as part of the dialogue process leading up to the drafting of the new NGO law, there has been a more constructive dialogue, which should be pursued. As with other policy reforms, this revenue-oriented reform will require serious monitoring in implementation, and a series of stakeholder meetings and reviews should be held at key points in the implementation process. These meetings should include lower-level Customs and DGI staff as well as senior managers, and the middle-management staff of key NGOs as well as Directors from Haiti and from overseas HQs.

- **Develop a Monitoring System and Implement It.** While it is realistic for the GOH to require that NGOs register their presence and mission, and report periodically on by-laws, officers, activities, and funding arrangements, such requirements should be streamlined. NGOs—whether international or national—should not be required to register with each sectoral ministry in whose sector they are active, as well as with the MPCE, and with the Ministry of Interior, the DGI, as well as the local territorial entities in the areas where they are actually carrying out projects and programs. There should be a once-for-all, relatively simple registration process that is possible to achieve within two months—rather like Congressional Notification in the US—if there is no question raised, then the NGO can consider itself registered. Annual financial or activity reporting should be part of an overall development assistance monitoring system rather than a separate *sui generis* system that is then open to manipulation.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NGO COMMUNITY IN HAITI

- **Define the Terms of Inter-NGO Collaboration and Partnership.** One of the NGO leaders who has spent the longest time in Haiti suggested during an early interview that what needed to happen was that HAVA, or the World Bank—or both—take the senior managers of all the major NGOs away to the beach, and sit them down until they hammered out their differences (and similarities). Others when interviewed about their relations with donors, the government and other stakeholders, pointed out that they should work harder on joint development of a code of ethics, for international as well as national organizations, and then should develop a system for monitoring their respective performance under the code. Almost all those interviewed said that they should do more and better in terms of working with and strengthening the capacity of local organizations, whether formal or informal. Most agreed that they should learn how to manage better for scarcity, and learn more about financial management and financial planning, so as to become self-sustaining.

- **Strengthen Mechanisms for Information Sharing.** Information-sharing is not cost-free, but neither is duplication of projects, or competition for the same beneficiary populations. It is ultimately

to the advantage of NGOs working in the same region, and/or in the same sector, to be forthcoming to each other, and to donors, local authorities, and the GOH about what they know of the range of interventions already in place when they propose to continue existing activities, or to undertake new ones.

- **Develop Criteria of Project Success and Methods to Assure Sustainability.** To the extent possible, NGOs should use their strategic planning and targeting systems—in concert with beneficiaries—to decide what the reasonable life of an intervention is, rather than being caught in the donor project cycle or, conversely, assuming that what is needed now will be needed forever. Empowerment means, among other things, that beneficiaries can and should make decisions for themselves. Sustainable development means that over time, the majority of empowered beneficiaries should be able to become self-sufficient, and to provide safety-nets for the most vulnerable among them.
